

From: [John Sacksteder](#)
To: [Kowalski, Cindy](#)
Cc: seis@ctsgec.com
Subject: FW: Tolling
Date: Wednesday, December 21, 2011 4:48:08 PM

From: Janice.Osadczyk@dot.gov [mailto:Janice.Osadczyk@dot.gov]
Sent: Wednesday, December 21, 2011 10:43 AM
To: ray471@yahoo.com
Cc: jsacksteder@ctsgec.com; khetrick@indot.in.gov; Gary.Valentine@ky.gov
Subject: FW: Tolling

Dear Raymond,

Thank you for your comments concerning the Ohio River Bridges project. Your comments are important to us. They will also be added to the project record.

From: Tally, Robert (FHWA)
Sent: Tuesday, December 20, 2011 12:49 PM
To: Osadczyk, Janice (FHWA)
Subject: FW: Tolling

fyi

From: Raymond Davis [mailto:ray471@yahoo.com]
Sent: Monday, December 19, 2011 2:43 PM
To: jsacksteder@ctsgec.com; Tally, Robert (FHWA); Sepulveda, Jose (FHWA); Walker, Cheryl (FHWA); ccolborn@gov.in.gov; s46@iga.in.gov; sstemler@insightbb.com
Subject: Tolling

To:

[John Sacksteder](#) (jsacksteder@ctsgec.com)

Bob Tally, (FHWA co-chair) Indiana Division
robert.tally@dot.gov
P: (317) 226-7476
Fax: (317) 226-7341

Jose Sepulveda, Division Administrator, Kentucky Division Office
Federal Highway Administration
jose.sepulveda@dot.gov
330 West Broadway, Room 264 Frankfort, Kentucky 40601
P: (502)223-6720 FAX: (502)223-6735

Ray Lahood - Cheryl J Walker/ Special Assistant
Federal Highway Administration
Office of the Federal Highway Administrator

(202) 366-6378
Cheryl.Walker@dot.gov

Earl Goode, Governor Daniels' chief of staff: ccolborn@gov.in.gov; Office: (317)232-1972

Ron Grooms, s46@iga.in.gov

Steve Stemler, 317-232-9600, sstemler@insightbb.com

Attend these public meetings:

December 19, 2011

4:00-8:00 p.m.

Papa John's Cardinal Stadium

Brown & Williamson Club

2800 S. Floyd St., Gate 6

Louisville, KY

December 20, 2011

4:00-8:00 p.m.

Holiday Inn Lakeview

505 Marriott Drive

Clarksville, IN

Why is tolling still part of the Ohio River Bridges Project?

One reason is the East End approach is too expensive.

The East End approach (the road to the East End Bridge) alone is \$798 million. That is about \$100,000 a foot! The East End Bridge, which crosses the Ohio River and Indiana's approach combined are \$558 million. The East End Bridge and Indiana's approach are \$240 million less than a 1.4 mile stretch of road on the Kentucky side?

How has that happened?

River Fields and the Kentucky Heritage Council

These two organizations have worked together from the beginning to keep an East End Bridge from becoming a reality.

These two have manipulated the East End approach part of this project using their influence to drive up project cost in effort to make it unaffordable.

River Fields has a lawsuit against the East End Bridge.

If we want a bridges project our community can afford, then we need to encourage serious reductions to the East End approach. This approach is nearly three times the amount of the bridge. This approach could be reduced over \$500 million.

"I do not believe my voice and opposition to tolls has been heard because of bureaucratic process and disinformation by the Bridges Project Team. My position remains: **No tolls**-build what we can afford beginning with the East End Bridge."

C.11

NO TOLLS ON ANY BRIDGE

None of the tolling options are acceptable. I am in favor of building a bridge project that can be built without tolls beginning with the East End Bridge.

If the modified project cannot be built without tolls, other alternatives should be considered including, eliminating the tunnel, building just the East End Bridge, and other cost-saving measures.

The Sherman Minton Bridge closure should not be used as an excuse to implement tolling.

I support improving the infrastructure. Spending more than we have is why America is in financial trouble. Build what we can afford and start with the East End Bridge. **Do not finance with tolls!**

Tolling will be a new "Hoosier tax" (cost of being a Hoosier) in this river city community. Southern Indiana is part of the complete Louisville Metro Area, representing about 1/8 of the population, yet absorbing 80% of the tolling. Tolls will have a disproportionate impact on Southern Indiana as 40,000 Hoosiers commute to Louisville on a daily basis. Almost all Hoosiers have to travel to Louisville, very few Kentuckians have to travel to Indiana. This will take \$50 million a year out of our Southern Indiana economy annually in tolls alone.

D.19

We should not think that tolling solves problems, when in reality tolling has resulted in so many problems. We should not allow tolling to take place. Keep reading to see examples of the many, many problems that have resulted from tolling:

C.16
D.20

Toll Bridge Problems in the News

Audit: Grand Isle toll bridge system fraught with problems

*A toll-collection system in south Louisiana is riddled with problems and may take **\$10 million to replace**, the legislative auditor said.*

<http://www.theadvocate.com/news/112586279.html>

Tacoma Narrows bridge tolling contractor has had problems in other states

*Thousands of bridge toll violations arrive in mailboxes, touching off a public uproar among residents who say they **don't deserve the fines**.*

<http://www.thenewstribune.com/2011/06/12/1702662/tolling-contractor-has-had-problems.html>

Florida Toll Bridge Agency in Dire Straits

The authority is the second toll agency in the Southeast that is in severe financial trouble.

http://www.bondbuyer.com/issues/119_408/florida-toll-bridge-agency-1016207-1.html

Toll bridge threatened by bankruptcy

...unless some sort of miracle happens soon, the bridge is going to default on its debts and its ownership will be snatched from the Santa Rosa Bay Bridge Authority.

<http://www.nwfdailynews.com/articles/bridge-37323-bay-rosa.html>

La 1 toll bridge has collections issues

A \$161 million toll bridge in far south Louisiana, which is embroiled in new controversy, has been plagued with troubles since it was authorized in 2005.

<http://www.2theadvocate.com/blogs/politicsblog/113945909.html>

What's behind the Delaware River Joint Toll Bridge Commission's sudden toll increase plan?

*Should the toll bridge commission, to secure its surplus, be **raising car tolls 33 percent** and hitting truckers harder with gas prices nearing \$4 a gallon?*

http://www.lehighvalleylive.com/tony-rhodin/index.ssf/2011/05/the_morning_note_whats_behind.html

Audit of New Orleans toll bridges unveils problems

*According to the Louisiana Legislative Auditor, the electronic toll system used on the bridges **does not work properly...***

<http://www.intheknowla.com/voiceology/headline-news/1460-audit-of-new-orleans-toll-bridges-unveils-problems.html>

E-toll problems on Carquinez bridge CA

Electronic tolling is getting a bad name in the Bay area.

<http://www.tollroadsnews.com/node/1922>

Consultants handling Seattle bridge tolling have history of problems

*Listen to this story from Cindy Christianson of Minneapolis, Minnesota: After she got a **notice in the mail she owed \$104** to the Illinois Toll Road Authority - a state she hadn't visited in years.*

<http://www.king5.com/news/local/Tolling-company-hired-by-WSDOT-has-history-of-problems-123781509.html>

Ron Angle wants resolution to abolish Delaware River Joint Toll Bridge Commission

Northampton County Councilman Ron Angle has some words for the Delaware River Joint Toll Bridge Commission: See ya!...

...a New Jersey state legislator said he plans to submit legislation today to abolish the commission following Monday's vote to increase bridge tolls.

http://www.lehighvalleylive.com/northampton-county/index.ssf/2011/05/northampton_county_councilman_4.html

Delaware River Bridge Tolls Increase July 1st

The toll jumps from \$4 to \$5 to use the Walt Whitman, Ben Franklin, Commodore Barry and Betsy Ross Bridges.

<http://philadelphia.cbslocal.com/2011/05/18/105557/>

From Good Intentions to Common Corruption

*According to Dyble, a large portion of bridge toll revenue went to lobbying, including a major campaign to stop rapid transit, which might cut into toll profits. It also **went to fund lavish parties, tours of Europe and a fleet of Cadillacs for Golden Gate Bridge and Highway District officials...***

...The Golden Gate Bridge and Highway District initially denied Dyble's request to access its

archives: "They told me to go away.

http://uscnews.usc.edu/politics_society/from_good_intentions_to_common_corruption.html

Delaware River Joint Toll Bridge Commission approval of hike without public input 'outrageous,' legislators say

New Jersey State Sen. [Michael Doherty](#) said it's "outrageous" that the [Delaware River Joint Toll Bridge Commission](#) approved a rate change Monday without first giving members of the public an opportunity to weigh in on the plan.

http://www.lehighvalleylive.com/today/index.ssf/2011/05/post_62.html

Toll Roads, Bridges Targeted for MAJOR FARE HIKES – FoxNews.com

Travelers and commuters feeling the pain at the pump should prepare for another financial hit — at the tolls.

...the state plans to jack up the Chesapeake Bay Bridge toll from \$2.50 to \$8 by summer 2013.

<http://sroblog.com/2011/06/18/toll-roads-bridges-targeted-for-major-fare-hikes-foxnews-com/>

Transportation officials say ICC is not to blame for toll hikes

Large increases in tolls on Maryland's bridges and tunnels were proposed last week, but Transportation Secretary Beverley Swaim-Staley said angry motorists should not be directing their blame at the new Intercounty Connector.

They should look around at the state's other toll roads, bridges and tunnels...

<http://marylandreporter.com/2011/05/15/transportation-officials-say-icc-is-not-to-blame-for-toll-hikes/>

M.T.A. Approves Bridge and Tunnel Toll Increases

Drivers who pay cash to traverse many of the region's major tunnels and bridges will pay significantly more by the end of this year, while E-ZPass users will see more modest increases, as the [Metropolitan Transportation Authority](#) on Wednesday approved the final stage of this year's big toll and fare increases.

<http://cityroom.blogs.nytimes.com/2010/10/27/m-t-a-approves-bridge-and-tunnel-toll-increases/>

US: Foreign Companies Buy U.S. Roads, Bridges

Roads and bridges built by U.S. taxpayers are starting to be sold off, and so far foreign-owned companies are doing the buying.

On a single day in June, an Australian-Spanish partnership paid \$3.8 billion to lease the Indiana Toll Road. An Australian company bought a 99-year lease on Virginia's Pocahontas Parkway, and Texas officials decided to let a Spanish-American partnership build and run a toll road from Austin to Seguin for 50 years.

<http://www.corpwatch.org/article.php?id=13909>

Port Authority proposes 25 percent toll increase on bridges, tunnels

Goethals and Bayonne bridges, Outerbridge Crossing would be \$8 for cash payers if approved

http://www.silive.com/news/index.ssf/2011/06/post_238/2039/comments-newest-3.html

Anti-toll group sends petition to U.S. Dept. of Transportation

The grassroots Say No To Bridge Tolls (SNTBT) group has gathered more than 10,000 signatures in an effort to petition the federal government to stop — please god, stop — the prospect of using tolls to pay for the \$4.1 billion Ohio River Bridges Project.

<http://fatlip.leoweekly.com/2010/11/23/anti-toll-group-sends-petition-to-u-s-dept-of-transportation/>

Related: **Report: Indiana Toll Road operator may default**

C.16

D.20

...The apparent financial difficulties have come about despite dramatic hikes in tolls since the 157-mile road was leased to a private consortium backed by Spain-based conglomerate Cintra and Australia-based Macquarie in June 2006.

Tolls for cars driving the length of the road are now \$8.80 as compared to \$4.65 when the lease was signed. Tolls for large semitrailer trucks are now \$35.20, as compared to \$18 when the lease was signed. Tolls are scheduled for another increase July 1....

http://www.nwintimes.com/business/local/article_9f320f01-4eed-5633-877a-f01cc7a7060e.html

////////////////////////////////////

There are many questions about this idea (E-Z Pass or similar system):

- The pay-toll-by-mail-or-credit-card system involves private businesses collecting the name, home address, phone number, social security number perhaps, credit card number, auto registration details, and more, from the owners (not necessarily the drivers) of cars that cross the bridge.
- Police no longer need Probable Cause to check those papers because they can do it from their car, without a court order, by computer. But the private bridge business administrators have no police authority and are not deputized, yet will do that search (without Probable Cause, as if that matters) anyway. Ordinary citizens or even un-authorized government employees cannot go that far into Motor Vehicle records and the personal information they contain.
- Many, for understandable reasons, do not want any persons (including, or especially, corporate "persons") being able to trace their name and address just by checking license plate numbers.
- What absolute assurances, enforced by what penalties, are there to forbid the use of private information for anything except toll collection?
- What penalties would there be if the information was used for commercial purposes for, say, advertising tourist or automotive services? What about using it to enforce auto insurance patronage or to find parking ticket scofflaws or those in default of alimony or student loan payments, or on and on? Can the info be used to find immigrants, Mexican or Irish or etc., who've over-stayed their visas? Will Homeland Security use this to monitor road travels of those on "no fly" lists or whatnot? Will opponents of this idea be branded "pro-terrorism"? Of course.
- If the toll for cars is to be a dollar, or two dollars, (it's not settled) that fee is increased not only by the 44 cent (for now) stamp needed to mail the toll payment (unless done by revealing credit card info to this private business on-line), but also there may be an added "administrative fee"...how much, not known...for those who don't use E-Z Pass.
- Yes, there may be a penalty for not patronizing E-Z Pass, a private business, not part of any public highway department or other agency. To restate...public government officials will penalize drivers for not contributing to the profits of a private business....
- Does this camera-toll system have reciprocal agreements with motor vehicle departments in every state and every Province of Canada? Will all those states and Provinces do this info retrieval for free?
- Tourists and others may be away from their home address for months and months...perhaps entire

semesters at school....perhaps as "snowbirds" off to un-oiled beaches in Florida . How can people pay without having to go home to find the bill in the mail? What will be the penalty if the bill is months late? How soon must the bill be paid? Will Private Collection Agencies be used? Will one's credit rating be affected?

C.16
D.20

- Many people drive others' cars....parents', boyfriends', etc. This toll-bill-mailing system then requires the car owner (who may or not be home for months, perhaps being away for the winter) to forward the bill to the driver thus increasing the chances of it being lost in the mail or overlooked.

- A car owner, not the driver, will have to prove innocence for not driving across that bridge and not paying a toll bill. The bridge administrators will not have to prove guilt. This is Napoleonic Law...not part of the US legal system. In fact, that is contrary to the US justice system. It's like Salem witch trials. Can you prove that you didn't cause that hail storm that wiped out the crops? Good luck.

- As for rental cars, rental business will be hit with the added task of either forwarding the bill to the renter, or somehow adding that toll fee to the renter's credit card...that is, IF the renter is even still using the same credit card. It isn't likely that Rental firms will do this chore for free...thus effectively raising the bridge toll even more...perhaps many times the cost of the base toll.

- Shipping and other delivery firms will simply add the toll costs to bills of every customer, even those who don't use the bridge or who don't even drive.

- Will it be the state that will do the billing enforcement (at public expense) for the private bridge business?

- How much of the toll goes to cover the cost of mailing the bills to tens of thousands of people (the non-EZ Pass travelers) each day? That's millions of notices a year....

- Will there be a sign informing motorists where to send the payment so they don't have to rely on the mail to make the transaction? Will addressed, pre-paid return envelopes be made available for that?

- Will there be adequate signage well before the bridge, before the last exit, to warn drivers that they will have their license plate photographed and the bill sent to address of registration, and with advice about how to avoid that if they wish?

- For economic reasons or privacy concerns or whatever reason, many will take side roads to an alternate bridge. Has there been an Environmental Impact Statement concerning what this extra traffic will do to side road air and water? Do local highway engineers and residents approve of this inevitable extra traffic, noise and exhaust? Have they had any say in this plan?

C.19

Raymond Davis
Jeffersonville, IN 47130